Lessons Learned in Fighting Corruption in Europe and Central Asia

#NextGenAntiCorruption

Irakli Kotetishvili
UNDP Regional Policy Specialist on Anti-Corruption and Public Administration

Amman, 17-19 October 2019
Snapshot of UNDP Istanbul Regional Hub and its Anti-Corruption Initiatives in the ECIS Region

• Istanbul Regional Hub covers 18 countries and territory in Europe and Central Asia

• Biggest anti-corruption projects: Kosovo*, Moldova, Uzbekistan and Ukraine

• Other countries have also introduced anti-corruption measures within projects, mostly related to public administration, e.g. Armenia, Kyrgyzstan, Georgia

• Big majority of these countries have national anti-corruption strategies

*All references to Kosovo shall be understood to be in the context of United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 (1999)
Corruption Perceptions Index (CPI)

- **19 COUNTRIES ASSESSED**
- **35/100 AVERAGE CPI REGIONAL SCORE**

**CPI points colour code:**
The CPI uses a scale from 0 to 100. 100 is very clean and 0 is highly corrupt.

**TOP SCORERS**
- Georgia: 56
- Montenegro: 45
- Belarus: 44

**BOTTOM SCORERS**
- Tajikistan: 25
- Uzbekistan: 23
- Turkmenistan: 20
### Rankings & Ease of Doing Business Score in the ECIS region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economy</th>
<th>Ease of Doing Business Rank</th>
<th>Rank within group</th>
<th>Starting a Business</th>
<th>Dealing with Construction Permits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Macedonia</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belarus</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armenia</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Developing countries face an annual gap of **USD2.5 trillion** to achieve Sustainable Development Goals by 2030.
What is the cost of corruption globally?

• Annually approximately **USD2.6 trillion** is lost to corruption globally

• This is **5 per cent** of the global gross domestic product and is **10 X more** than the official development assistance globally

• Businesses and individuals pay more than **USD1 trillion** in bribes every year

• In Europe and Central Asia **1 in 3 citizens** believe that corruption is a biggest problem facing their country
Are we fighting corruption successfully?

• **Traditionally approach:** AC National Strategies and Action-Plans, legislation on prevention, investigation and prosecution of corruption. Harsh laws, but very little progress to deter corruption

• **Lack of political will:** sometimes governments care more about short-term success in international AC rankings, rather than strong and sustainable AC reforms

• **Technology is key:** in the era of 4th Industrial Revolution and emergence of Internet of Things, robotics, virtual reality and artificial intelligence, governments need to invest more in digitalization of public service delivery and prevention of corruption
Important Factors to Consider for PACC While Working on the National AC Strategy for Palestine 2020-2022

1. Keep the momentum of a strong political will and adopt the Strategy

2. AC Strategies by default are strong documents. Key to success is their implementation

3. Secure the budget for the implementation of the National AC Strategy

4. Modernize public services delivery as well as state bureaucracy using technological solutions (e-public procurement, e-auctions, online access to public data)

5. Keep the regulations at a minimum number (licensing, permits etc.)

6. Avoid creating additional agencies and bureaucracy for the implementation of the National AC Strategy
UNDP helps governments in Europe and Central Asia to fight corruption: #NextGenAntiCorruption

• We provide policy and programme support in the design and implementation of effective AC reforms and initiatives

• We also support in carrying out Corruption Risk Assessments and development of National Anti-Corruption Strategies and in their implementation

• We advocate for a bigger role of technology in the fight against corruption and inclusion of civil society in decision-making processes: open data portals, technology-based public services delivery, one-stop shops, corruption reporting online and mobile tools etc.
First UNDP Community of Practice for the ECIS Region and Forum on Innovations in Anti-Corruption, 14-15 May, Tashkent, Uzbekistan: #NextGenAntiCorruption
What are the key emerging trends in the fight against corruption?

✓ **innovation and disruptive technologies** help governments to operate in a more transparent and efficient manner and deliver higher quality public services.

✓ Innovation alone if it is not coupled with human-centric and **rights-based approaches**, will not be successful; strengthening **civic engagement** is a key.

✓ Innovation can be used not only for good cause but also for committing **complex corruption crimes** (e.g. using cryptocurrencies, fake digital IDs etc.)
We need to also work with the private sector

• The private sector has the potential to be a game changer

• Globally, private sector accounts for 60% of GDP, 90% of jobs and 80% of capital flows on average in developing countries
What can the private sector do?

- Companies can tackle corruption individually or through collective action, to raise corporate governance standards and adopt more sustainable business practices.

- Businesses can ensure their compliance with laws and relevant standards, and strengthen their internal control mechanisms by carrying out corruption-risk assessments.

- Disclosure and regular audits.

- Whistleblower protection and safe channels for feedback and complaints.

- Clear rules on conflicts of interest (e.g. companies should establish guidelines regarding gifts, hospitality, travel and entertainment, political and charitable contributions).
The role of the government

- Most corruption-prone areas in public-private sector interface are: public procurements (57%), licenses and permits, judiciary, politicians and tax collection

- Governments should ensure that its anti-corruption laws and the National Anti-Corruption Strategies include clear provisions on business integrity

- Since governments act as formal owners of State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs), they should proactively introduce compliance programs in those businesses.

- In some countries, national governments have established Business Ombudsman institutions, mandated to act in the best interests of private sectors and as a medium between them and the state.

- The United Nations Convention against Corruption (UNCAC) includes provisions on business integrity
Case-study #1: Monitoring of public procurement process in Ukraine: from ProZorro to DozoRro
ProZorro is a hybrid electronic open source government e-procurement system created as the result of a partnership between business, government and the civil society.

ProZorro is a fully online public procurement platform and a collaboration environment that ensures open access to public procurement (tenders) in Ukraine. Fully implemented in 2016 as a hybrid (both centralized public and decentralized private marketplaces) system it has since been globally recognized as one of the most...
Public Procurement Monitoring:

community
**DOZORRO** impact areas

- Developing civic tech for open data to analyse and to monitor public spending
- Providing unique feedback loop on public procurement via [dozorro.org](http://dozorro.org)
- Raising awareness though educational materials and events
- Giving voice to local stories
- Training and capacity building for watchdog activists
- A strong civil society community in the regions all over the Ukraine
84000 Feedback Cases as of March 31, 2019
UNDP assisted Construction Sector Transparency Initiative (CoST) in Ukraine

- CoST comes in when the infrastructure construction contract is signed between the Gov and the private sector
- CoST assists the governments to monitor implementation of infrastructure construction projects
Case study #2: Modernization of public service delivery
UNDP helps to improve public services delivery

• For example, UNDP supported opening of one-stop shops in Albania, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Moldova, Serbia, Ukraine, Uzbekistan

• More and more public services moving from one-stop-shops to online citizen-portals: my.gov.uz portal in Uzbekistan, e-Citizen portal in Serbia, my.gov.ge in Georgia
Case study #3: Online Asset Declaration Systems in Georgia and Ukraine
Georgia

• All senior Georgian officials submit their asset declarations annually through Online Asset Declaration System www.declaration.gov.ge managed by Civil Service Bureau

• Submitted declarations are published instantly on the same website www.declaration.gov.ge
This is how CSB’s office archive looked like **before 2010**
This is how CSB’s new “storage” looks like since 2010

>> [www.declaration.gov.ge](http://www.declaration.gov.ge)
Ukraine

• Ukraine launched online asset disclosure system in 2016 with support of UNDP and other development partners

• All declarations are publicly accessible on: https://public.nazk.gov.ua/

• It is based on e-signature and other secure authentication methodologies

• It has an open API, which enables easy data access by tech groups
Единий державний реєстр декларацій
осіб, уповноважених на виконання функцій держави або місцевого самоврядування

ПРО РЕЄСТР   ВІДКРИТИЙ API   СТАТИСТИЧНІ ДАНІ

Пошук

Тип декларації:   Рік:   Тип документу:   Тип посади: (0)   Категорія посади: (0)   Период публікації:   Високий ризик:   Відповідальне становище: (0)

РЕЗУЛЬТАТИ ПОШУКУ (46)

1. Поровай Ірина Олегівна
   Дата публікації: 19.03.2017 12:15
   Використана декларація (щорічна)
   Посада: головний спеціаліст відділу з питань призначення, пенсійних та інших пенсій

2. Пор'єс Аліна Вадимівна
   Дата публікації: 16.03.2017 19:01
   Використана декларація (щорічна)
   Посада: провідний спеціаліст відділу соціальної інтеграції управління з питань шкідливих захисту та соціальної інтеграції ГУДМС України в Одеській області

3. Пор'єс Аліна Вадимівна
   Дата публікації: 16.03.2017 18:52
   Використана декларація (перед звільненням)
   Посада: провідний спеціаліст відділу соціальної інтеграції управління з питань шкідливих захисту та соціальної інтеграції ГУДМС України в Одеській області

4. Поровай Ірина Олегівна
   Дата публікації: 13.03.2017 18:41
   Декларація (щорічна)

5. Порало Микола Васильович
   Дата публікації: 09.03.2017 11:38
   Декларація (щорічна)
ЄДИННИЙ ДЕРЖАВНИЙ РЕЄСТР ДЕКЛАРАЦІЙ
осіб, уповноважених на виконання функцій держави або місцевого самоврядування

ПРО РЕЄСТР

ВІДКРИТІЙ API

СТАТИСТИЧНІ ДАНІ

Poшук:

Тип декларації: 
Рік: 
Тип документу: 
Підрозділ: 
Категорія посади: 
Період публікації: 

Високий ризик: 
Відповідальне становище: 

ВІДКРИТІЙ API

Дані про подані декларації доступні у машиннозчитуваному форматі JSON.

Приклади запитів:
https://public-api.nazk.gov.ua/v1/declaration?q=Чер
https://public-api.nazk.gov.ua/v1/declaration?q=Володимирович

Приклад відповіді на запит:

```json
{
  "page":{
    "batchsize":120,
    "totalItems":8
  },
  "items": [
    {
      "id": "bff8fc4d-6d0c-46e7-b82e-c4fe72c6e833",
      "firstname": "Федор Володимирович",
      "lastname": "Черненко"
    }
  ]
}
```
Public monitoring of asset declarations: 
https://declarations.com.ua
Cash, fur coats, Fabergé eggs: Ukraine officials reveal extravagant hidden wealth

by Victoria Butenko and Alanna Petroff  @CNNMoney

November 1, 2016  12:28 PM ET
Case study #4: Fighting corruption on local levels through citizen-participation and public monitoring
Creating “Islands of Integrity” in 5 municipalities

• Co-designing local anti-corruption strategy together with local officials, CSOs, media and citizens based on the corruption-risk assessment results

• UNDP can act as a facilitator of the process

• Project countries: Armenia, Georgia, Moldova, North Macedonia, Ukraine
Online tool to Corruption-Free Local Government: https://corruptionfreecities.org/
Thank you!

#NextGenAntiCorruption

www.eurasia.undp.org

irakli.kotetishvili@undp.org

https://twitter.com/IRAKLIkotetishv